

# 2018 <br> Consumer Returns <br> in the Retail Industry 

## Introduction

Appriss Retail is pleased to incorporate the return results from the National Retail Federation (NRF) 2018 Organized Retail Crime Survey into the 13th edition of the Consumer Returns in the Retail Industry report.

## Annual US Merchandise Returns

Total merchandise returns account for nearly $\$ 369$ billion in lost sales for US retailers. This is close to the market cap value of Facebook (November 2018).


## Industry Issues

- A return is a lost sale. Cash, profits, and margin percentage are reduced.
- Returns increase labor costs due to inspection and re-stocking time.
- Returns cause markdowns, out-of-stocks, and other expenses to increase.
- Higher returns require more working capital to source merchandise.
- How returns are handled impacts consumer perceptions positively or negatively.


## Opportunities

- The point-of-return is a real customer service "moment of truth."
- Returns are an opportunity to cross-sell or up-sell a known customer.
- In-store returns are a chance to meet and convert an online buyer.


## Buy Online Return In-Store (BORIS) Growth



[^0]Loss from annual merchandise return fraud is estimated at $\$ 18.4$ billion, and fraud and abuse combined is estimated at $\$ 24$ billion for the US retail industry.

## Annual US Returns and Return Fraud

| METRIC | MEDIAN <br> RATE <br> $(4)$ | 2018 |
| :--- | :---: | :---: |
| NRF retail industry sales ${ }^{(1)}$ | $100 \%$ | $\$ 3,688^{(2)}$ |
| Amount of merchandise returned as <br> a percent of total sales | $10.0 \%$ | $\$ 369$ |
| Estimated amount of fraudulent <br> returns as a percent of total returns | $5.0 \%$ | $\$ 18.4$ |
| Estimated amount of return fraud and <br> abuse as a percent of total returns |  |  |

Source: National Retail Federation 2018 Organized Retail Crime Survey. November 2018. All dollars in billions.
${ }^{(1)}$ The National Retail Federation's US retail industry sales figure includes most traditional retail categories including non-store, auto parts and accessories stores, discounters, department stores, grocery stores, and specialty stores, and exclude sales at automotive dealers, gas stations, and restaurants.
${ }^{(2)}$ Retail sales (in billions) estimated by NRF using 2017 actuals and an estimated growth rate of $4.5 \%$.
${ }^{(3)}$ Return fraud and abuse estimates are derived from trends established in previous years of the Consumer Returns in the Retail Industry report. These figures average approximately 1 to 2 percentage points higher than return fraud.
${ }^{(4)}$ NRF notes that findings are directional only. All findings are among the responding companies and have not been scaled as a reflection on the retail industry as a whole, or to match firmographics of prior years' surveys.

## US Holiday Returns and Return Fraud

| METRIC | MEDIAN RATE (4) | 2018 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| NRF holiday sales ${ }^{(5)}$ | 100\% | \$719(6) |
| Amount of merchandise returned as a percent of holiday sales | 10.0\% | \$72 |
| Estimated amount of fraudulent returns as a percent of holiday returns | 9.0\% | \$6.5 |

Source: National Retail Federation 2018 Organized Retail Crime Survey. November 2018. All dollars in billions.
${ }^{(5)}$ NRF US holiday sales are defined as retail industry sales in the full months of November and December.
${ }^{(6)}$ Holiday sales (in billions) estimated by NRF using 2017 actuals and an estimated growth rate of 4.55\%.

## Return Fraud by Receipt and Channel

## RETURNS MADE WITHOUT A RECEIPT

(11.8\% of returns are non-receipted)


ONLINE TO BRICKS-AND-MORTAR RETURNS


Source: National Retail Federation 2018 Organized Retail Crime Survey. November 2018.

## Lost US Sales Tax Impact of Return Fraud and Abuse

map of lost state sales tax by state


## Key Findings

Because of the significant retail revenue losses caused by return fraud and abuse states are losing a total of $\$ 1.1$ billion to $\$ 1.5$ billion in sales tax revenues For simplicity, this table lists only state tax rates; the myriad county and local taxes are not individually calculated. It is estimated there are another $\$ 276$ million to $\$ 359$ million lost at the local level due to return fraud.

Retailers must offset the negative business impact of return fraud and abuse by increasing prices to consumers and by reducing costs-which too often means a loss of jobs. At an average retail salary of just over $\$ 30,366^{(3)}$ per year, return fraud and abuse is costing retailers and American workers between 607,400 and 789,600 jobs.

| STATE | \% OF NATIONWIDE RETAIL SALES | SALES | RETURNS | STATE SALES TAX RATE ${ }^{(2)}$ | RETURN F RETALL REVENUE | StIMATE ${ }^{(4)}$ LOST SALES TAXREVENUE |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Alabama | 1.50\% | \$55,320,000,000 | \$6,146,666,667 | 4.000\% | \$307,333,333 | \$12,293,333 | \$399,533,333 | \$15,981,333 |
| Alaska | 0.26\% | \$9,588,800,000 | \$1,065,422,222 | 0.000\% | \$53,271,111 | \$0 | \$69,252,444 | \$0 |
| Arizona | 2.24\% | \$82,611,200,000 | \$9,179,022,222 | 5.600\% | \$458,951,111 | \$25,701,262 | \$596,636,444 | \$33,411,641 |
| Arkansas | 0.91\% | \$33,560,800,000 | \$3,728,977,778 | 6.500\% | \$186,448,889 | \$12,119,178 | \$242,383,556 | \$15,754,931 |
| California | 11.90\% | \$438,872,000,000 | \$48,763,555,556 | 6.000\% | \$2,438,177,778 | \$146,290,667 | \$3,169,631,111 | \$190,177,867 |
| Colorado | 1.70\% | \$62,696,000,000 | \$6,966,222,222 | 2.900\% | \$348,311,111 | \$10,101,022 | \$452,804,444 | \$13,131,329 |
| Connecticut | 1.25\% | \$46,100,000,000 | \$5,122,222,222 | 6.350\% | \$256,111,111 | \$16,263,056 | \$332,944,444 | \$21,141,972 |
| Delaware | 0.37\% | \$13,645,600,000 | \$1,516,177,778 | 0.000\% | \$75,808,889 | \$0 | \$98,551,556 | \$0 |
| Dist. of Columbia | 0.15\% | \$5,532,000,000 | \$614,666,667 | 6.000\% | \$30,733,333 | \$1,844,000 | \$39,953,333 | \$2,397,200 |
| Florida | 7.30\% | \$269,224,000,000 | \$29,913,777,778 | 6.000\% | \$1,495,688,889 | \$89,741,333 | \$1,944,395,556 | \$116,663,733 |
| Georgia | 3.01\% | \$111,008,800,000 | \$12,334,311,111 | 4.000\% | \$616,715,556 | \$24,668,622 | \$801,730,222 | \$32,069,209 |
| Hawaii | 0.50\% | \$18,440,000,000 | \$2,048,888,889 | 4.000\% | \$102,444,444 | \$4,097,778 | \$133,177,778 | \$5,327,111 |
| Idaho | 0.51\% | \$18,808,800,000 | \$2,089,866,667 | 6.000\% | \$104,493,333 | \$6,269,600 | \$135,841,333 | \$8,150,480 |
| Illinois | 4.05\% | \$149,364,000,000 | \$16,596,000,000 | 6.250\% | \$829,800,000 | \$51,862,500 | \$1,078,740,000 | \$67,421,250 |
| Indiana | 1.99\% | \$73,391,200,000 | \$8,154,577,778 | 7.000\% | \$407,728,889 | \$28,541,022 | \$530,047,556 | \$37,103,329 |
| Iowa | 0.92\% | \$33,929,600,000 | \$3,769,955,556 | 6.000\% | \$188,497,778 | \$11,309,867 | \$245,047,111 | \$14,702,827 |
| Kansas | 0.79\% | \$29,135,200,000 | \$3,237,244,444 | 6.500\% | \$161,862,222 | \$10,521,044 | \$210,420,889 | \$13,677,358 |
| Kentucky | 1.26\% | \$46,468,800,000 | \$5,163,200,000 | 6.000\% | \$258,160,000 | \$15,489,600 | \$335,608,000 | \$20,136,480 |
| Lovisiana | 1.33\% | \$49,050,400,000 | \$5,450,044,444 | 4.450\% | \$272,502,222 | \$12,126,349 | \$354,252,889 | \$15,764,254 |
| Maine | 0.51\% | \$18,808,800,000 | \$2,089,866,667 | 5.500\% | \$104,493,333 | \$5,747,133 | \$135,841,333 | \$7,471,273 |
| Maryland | 1.99\% | \$73,391,200,000 | \$8,154,577,778 | 6.000\% | \$407,728,889 | \$24,463,733 | \$530,047,556 | \$31,802,853 |
| Massachusetts | 2.34\% | \$86,299,200,000 | \$9,588,800,000 | 6.250\% | \$479,440,000 | \$29,965,000 | \$623,272,000 | \$38,954,500 |
| Michigan | 3.10\% | \$114,328,000,000 | \$12,703,111,111 | 6.000\% | \$635,155,556 | \$38,109,333 | \$825,702,222 | \$49,542,133 |
| Minnesota | 1.80\% | \$66,384,000,000 | \$7,376,000,000 | 6.875\% | \$368,800,000 | \$25,355,000 | \$479,440,000 | \$32,961,500 |
| Mississippi | 0.89\% | \$32,823,200,000 | \$3,647,022,222 | 7.000\% | \$182,351,111 | \$12,764,578 | \$237,056,444 | \$16,593,951 |
| Missouri | 1.97\% | \$72,653,600,000 | \$8,072,622,222 | 4.225\% | \$403,631,111 | \$17,053,414 | \$524,720,444 | \$22,169,439 |
| Montana | 0.36\% | \$13,276,800,000 | \$1,475,200,000 | 0.000\% | \$73,760,000 | \$0 | \$95,888,000 | \$0 |
| Nebraska | 0.62\% | \$22,865,600,000 | \$2,540,622,222 | 5.500\% | \$127,031,111 | \$6,986,711 | \$165,140,444 | \$9,082,724 |
| Nevada | 1.14\% | \$42,043,200,000 | \$4,671,466,667 | 6.850\% | \$233,573,333 | \$15,999,773 | \$303,645,333 | \$20,799,705 |
| New Hampshire | 0.67\% | \$24,709,600,000 | \$2,745,511,111 | 0.000\% | \$137,275,556 | \$0 | \$178,458,222 | \$0 |
| New Jersey | 3.12\% | \$115,065,600,000 | \$12,785,066,667 | 6.625\% | \$639,253,333 | \$42,350,533 | \$831,029,333 | \$55,055,693 |
| New Mexico | 0.62\% | \$22,865,600,000 | \$2,540,622,222 | 5.125\% | \$127,031,111 | \$6,510,344 | \$165,140,444 | \$8,463,448 |
| New York | 5.93\% | \$218,698,400,000 | \$24,299,822,222 | 4.000\% | \$1,214,991,111 | \$48,599,644 | \$1,579,488,444 | \$63,179,538 |
| North Carolina | 2.89\% | \$106,583,200,000 | \$11,842,577,778 | 4.750\% | \$592,128,889 | \$28,126,122 | \$769,767,556 | \$36,563,959 |
| North Dakota | 0.25\% | \$9,220,000,000 | \$1,024,444,444 | 5.000\% | \$51,222,222 | \$2,561,111 | \$66,588,889 | \$3,329,444 |
| Ohio | 3.39\% | \$125,023,200,000 | \$13,891,466,667 | 5.750\% | \$694,573,333 | \$39,937,967 | \$902,945,333 | \$51,919,357 |
| Oklahoma | 1.00\% | \$36,880,000,000 | \$4,097,777,778 | 4.500\% | \$204,888,889 | \$9,220,000 | \$266,355,556 | \$11,986,000 |
| Oregon | 1.27\% | \$46,837,600,000 | \$5,204,177,778 | 0.000\% | \$260,208,889 | \$0 | \$338,271,556 | \$0 |
| Pennsylvania | 4.07\% | \$150,101,600,000 | \$16,677,955,556 | 6.000\% | \$833,897,778 | \$50,033,867 | \$1,084,067,111 | \$65,044,027 |
| Rhode Island | 0.34\% | \$12,539,200,000 | \$1,393,244,444 | 7.000\% | \$69,662,222 | \$4,876,356 | \$90,560,889 | \$6,339,262 |
| South Carolina | 1.36\% | \$50,156,800,000 | \$5,572,977,778 | 6.000\% | \$278,648,889 | \$16,718,933 | \$362,243,556 | \$21,734,613 |
| South Dakota | 0.32\% | \$11,801,600,000 | \$1,311,288,889 | 4.500\% | \$65,564,444 | \$2,950,400 | \$85,233,778 | \$3,835,520 |
| Tennessee | 2.10\% | \$77,448,000,000 | \$8,605,333,333 | 7.000\% | \$430,266,667 | \$30,118,667 | \$559,346,667 | \$39,154,267 |
| Texas | 7.49\% | \$276,231,200,000 | \$30,692,355,556 | 6.250\% | \$1,534,617,778 | \$95,913,611 | \$1,995,003,111 | \$124,687,694 |
| Utah | 0.84\% | \$30,979,200,000 | \$3,442,133,333 | 4.700\% | \$172,106,667 | \$8,089,013 | \$223,738,667 | \$10,515,717 |
| Vermont | 0.25\% | \$9,220,000,000 | \$1,024,444,444 | 6.000\% | \$51,222,222 | \$3,073,333 | \$66,588,889 | \$3,995,333 |
| Virginia | 2.63\% | \$96,994,400,000 | \$10,777,155,556 | 5.000\% | \$538,857,778 | \$26,942,889 | \$700,515,111 | \$35,025,756 |
| Washington | 2.26\% | \$83,348,800,000 | \$9,260,977,778 | 6.500\% | \$463,048,889 | \$30,098,178 | \$601,963,556 | \$39,127,631 |
| West Virginia | 0.54\% | \$19,915,200,000 | \$2,212,800,000 | 6.000\% | \$110,640,000 | \$6,638,400 | \$143,832,000 | \$8,629,920 |
| Wisconsin | 1.80\% | \$66,384,000,000 | \$7,376,000,000 | 5.000\% | \$368,800,000 | \$18,440,000 | \$479,440,000 | \$23,972,000 |
| Wyoming | 0.21\% | \$7,744,800,000 | \$860,533,333 | 4.000\% | \$43,026,667 | \$1,721,067 | \$55,934,667 | \$2,237,387 |
| Total |  |  |  |  |  | \$1,128,605,346 |  | \$1,467,186,949 |

## Examples of Return Fraud

Of the retailers that allow Buy Online Return In-Store (BORIS) returns, $86 \%$ are seeing the same or more fraud.

Which examples of return fraud have your company experienced in the past year?

| RETURN FRAUD EXAMPLES | 2018 |
| :--- | :---: |
| Return of stolen merchandise (shoplifting) | $77.3 \%$ |
| Employee return fraud or collusion with external sources | $63.6 \%$ |
| Return of merchandise purchased with fraudulent or stolen tender | $59.1 \%$ |
| Returns made by organized retail crime groups | $48.5 \%$ |
| Wardrobing or renting (returns of used, non-defective merchandise) | $31.8 \%$ |

Source: National Retail Federation 2018 Organized Retail Crime Survey. November 2018.

## Key Findings

- Shoplifting and returning those stolen items took the top spot, impacting many retailers surveyed (77\%); this situation requires consideration because of its potential for significant impact on fraud and shrink.
- Return fraud as a result of both employee actions or ORC groups affects about 60\% of retailers.


## Financial Summary of Return Fraud and Abuse in the US

| CATEGORY | MEDIAN RATE | RETAIL INDUSTRY | EXAMPLE COMPANY <br> (\$1 BILLION REVENUE) | LOSS PER \$100 |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  |  |  | $\begin{gathered} \text { OF } \\ \text { SALES } \end{gathered}$ | OF RETURNS |
| Retail sales (in-store and online) | 100\% | \$3,688,850,000,000 | \$1,000,000,000 |  |  |
| Returns | 10.0\% | \$368,885,000,000 | \$100,000,000 |  |  |
| Return fraud ${ }^{(1)}$ | 5.0\% | \$18,444,250,000 | \$5,000,000 | \$0.50 | \$5.00 |
| Return fraud and abuse ${ }^{(2)}$ | 6.5\% | \$23,977,525,000 | \$6,500,000 | \$0.65 | \$6.50 |

Source: National Retail Federation 2018 Organized Retail Crime Survey. November 2018.
${ }^{(1)}$ Estimate derived from: National Retail Federation 2018 Organized Retail Crime Survey. November 2018.
${ }^{(2)}$ Estimate derived from trends established in previous years of the Consumer Returns in the Retail Industry report.

## Return Rate by Retail Category

| RETAIL CATEGORY | BLENDED <br> RETURN RATE |
| :--- | :---: |
| Apparel | $12.78 \%$ |
| Auto Parts | $22.58 \%$ |
| Beauty | $6.19 \%$ |
| Department Stores | $12.52 \%$ |
| Drug/Pharmacies | $2.14 \%$ |
| Footwear | $9.41 \%$ |
| Hard Goods | $12.27 \%$ |
| Home Improvement | $11.84 \%$ |
| Housewares | $12.28 \%$ |
| Sporting Goods | $9.03 \%$ |
| NRF Survey Median ${ }^{(2)(3)}$ | $10.0 \%$ |

${ }^{(1)}$ Retail category rates derived from Appriss Retail analysis of 40,000 stores in the specialty and general merchandise retail segments. Appriss Retail reviews data direct from ecommerce and POS T-Logs-so all returns, exchanges, on-line returns, employee sale returns, and other refund scenarios are considered to build a blended return rate.
${ }^{(2)}$ Source: National Retail Federation 2018 Organized Retail Crime Survey. November 2018
${ }^{(3)}$ The NRF survey median return rate (10.0\%) is lower than the blended return rate in several of the retail categories because it includes retailers outside of these select categories, like grocery stores.

## Returns, Shrink, and Total Loss

In the competitive world of retail, it is essential to understand how returns and return fraud reduce net sales and contribute to inventory shortage (shrink) and total loss. This information can be used by loss prevention professionals to compare their own program results, with an eye toward developing best practices and reducing losses from this source.

## Omnichannel/BORIS Transactions

Preventing fraud is only one of the challenges at the retail return desk; improving the shopping experience is an equally important trend. Additionally, the increase in buy-online-return-in-store (BORIS) returns is driving new demands-such as offering "frictionless" returns. The ability to offer more flexible and lenient returns, while still mitigating the risk of fraud and abuse, is ever more critical.

## Respondent Profile

Those responding to the National Retail Federation 2018 Organized Retail Crime Survey reflect a variety of categories, number of stores, and annual sales. Overall, $48 \%$ of responding companies have at least 500 stores and $69 \%$ have sales of $\$ 1$ billion or more.

For a copy of the National Retail Federation 2018 Organized Retail Crime Survey that generated portions of this executive summary report, please contact Bob Moraca, National Retail Federation, VP-Loss Prevention at moracar@nrf.com.

## 2018 Consumer Returns in the Retail Industry


[^0]:    Source: National Retail Federation 2018 Organized Retail Crime Survey. November 2018.

